

Annex D

Consultation Questions

Question 1. Do you agree that the MOD has identified the options and factors that MOD should consider before deciding whether or not to extend the audit of the spectrum it uses?

In identifying the options and factors before extending band audits, it is important for the MoD to consider all factors including the use made of spectrum in rural areas and potential use by charitable and social groups.

Question 2. Do you have any views on the priority with which MOD should audit its spectrum use?

A clearly published timetable would allow sharing parties to prepare their position

Question 3. Do you agree with the phased approach to applying for RSA that the MOD is proposing?

The phased approach allows time for organisations to examine their position in respect to these bands and if necessary prepare for any subsequent bid position.

The Scottish Government (SG) has an interest in the 3442-3475 MHz band and would seek to engage in any consultations between MoD and other affected Government Departments before any change was proposed to the status of this band. The SG gets comfort from the stated intention of MoD not to ask for RSA for this band.

Question 4. Do you agree with the MOD's plans for releasing and sharing the spectrum it uses?

Although Scottish emergency services users have access to relatively small amounts of MoD spectrum, the importance to them of these bands is very high including substantial financial investments in specialised equipment that requires a high degrees of protection. The SG will look for safeguards to ensure the integrity of existing users in shared bands.

Question 5. Do you agree with MOD's priorities for releasing and sharing spectrum?

Question 6. Do you agree with MOD's outline timetable for initial spectrum releases?

We believe the important factor is transparency in the timetable so affected parties can engage with MoD and the user community.

Question 7. Do you agree that MOD has correctly and fully identified the factors and options that should be considered before deciding to release and acquire spectrum in the market?

Question 8. Do you agree that MOD has correctly and fully identified the factors and options that should be considered before deciding the best means with which to interact with the market?

The engagement with the market for radio spectrum is a relatively new concept within Government, and other Departments will be interested in the experience gained by the MoD involvement hopefully to learn and benefit from the experiences.

Question 9. Can you identify any different approaches for the MOD to manage the spectrum it uses and engage with the market to deliver better value for money for defence and the taxpayer?

Question 10. Which options (from paragraph 6.7) should be considered, or discounted, and if so why; either in respect of options already identified in section 6, or additional options, not identified?

There are pros and cons with all 3 options as this is uncharted territory but a general presumption towards engaging with the market has been suggested assuming a fair and transparent method is employed.

Question 11. Which issues relating to section 6 should be considered when evaluating options, and if so why; either in respect of issues already identified in that section, or additional issues, not identified?

There are still questions that have to be resolved in respect to the costs of sharing and how it relates to AIP for the band. Costs need to be fair and transparent, recognising that demand and use of spectrum will vary greatly throughout the country so fair and equitable methods have to be reached to ensure that rural and low populated areas are not disadvantaged.

Question 12. Is the scope of decisions required against each of the four questions at paragraph 6.3, as indicated in section 6, sufficient and, if not, how and why it should be extended?

It is for the MoD to decide whether a third party is the best way to manage its spectrum holdings and like all Government Departments will have to demonstrate that it is achieving Value for Money (VfM) for whatever option is adopted. The SG is considering independently its own position in relation to spectrum management and will seek a cost effective solution.

ends